



Department of Health

20/01/2015

DE00000911616

Your ref: MISC-2015-01-DoH

Dear Mr Henness,

Thank you for your request of 10 January 2015 under the Freedom of Information Act (2000). Your exact request was:

“Under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, please provide the following.

A letter from George Freeman MP to Dr Julian Huppert MP dated 7 January 2015 (see attached) categorised responses to the DoH consultation on the Medical Innovation Bill thus:

“Out of 170 respondents, 72 expressed absolute opposition – with a further 18 expressing a less strong opposition, with some positive reflections. 37 respondents were entirely supportive of the Bill, and a further 23 expressed a measure of support with some reservations. For a further 20 respondents it was unclear whether their position was supportive or otherwise.”

Please provide the names of the organisations or individuals responding in each of these categories and what criteria were used to determine into which category each response fell.”

The Department holds information relevant to your request.

As explained in the letter to Julian Huppert MP, categorisation of the responses was not a simple task as a number of the responses expressed a nuanced view.

Respondents who answered ‘Yes’ or ‘No’ to the final consultation question “Overall, should the draft Bill become law?” were categorised as ‘absolute support’ and ‘absolute opposition’ respectively.

Those who answered this question with the response ‘Yes with modifications outlined in response to questions 3-5’ or ‘Yes with other modifications’ were largely classed as ‘supportive with reservations’. However, in some instances the modifications proposed or wider response demonstrated significant opposition to the Bill, in which case the response was categorised as

'opposition with positive reflections'.

Some responses were categorised as 'unclear' for a variety of reasons including: where the respondent expressed views on subjects wider than the topic of the Bill, or when the respondent did not express a personal view.

A large number of respondents did not complete all nine questions, in these instances a holistic view was taken of their response to see which category it best suited.

It is important to highlight that the purpose of the consultation exercise was not to discover the numbers of those supportive or opposed, it sought instead to reveal the range of views on the topic. As explained in the letter to Julian Huppert MP, the consultation response summary is an accurate reflection of the diversity of views we heard from organisations and the public.

The attached table sets out the respondents and how they have been categorised. Please note that it has not been possible to disclose the names of individuals who responded in a personal capacity under Section 40(2) of the Freedom of Information Act which provides for the protection of personal information. Section 40 prohibits a public body from disclosing personally identifiable information as to do so would contravene data protection principles.

However, where possible, individual respondents have been categorised as:

- Doctor
- Patient/ relative/ carer
- Legal
- Other

If you have any queries about this email, please contact me. Please remember to quote the reference number above in any future communications.

If you are dissatisfied with the handling of your request, you have the right to ask for an internal review. Internal review requests should be submitted within two months of the date of receipt of the response to your original letter and should be addressed to:

Head of the Freedom of Information Team
Department of Health
Room 520
Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2NS

Email: freedomofinformation@dh.gsi.gov.uk

If you are not content with the outcome of your complaint, you may apply directly to the Information Commissioner (ICO) for a decision. Generally, the ICO cannot make a decision unless you have exhausted the complaints procedure provided by the Department. The ICO can be contacted at:

The Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF

Yours sincerely,

Jonathan Young

Freedom of Information Officer
Department of Health

freedomofinformation@dh.gsi.gov.uk

Organisation name/ individual type	Position
Lanyon Bowdler	Opposition with positive reflections
Slater and Gordon	Opposition with positive reflections
Other	Opposition with positive reflections
Doctor	Opposition with positive reflections
Institute of Cancer Research	Opposition with positive reflections
British Pharmacological Society	Opposition with positive reflections
NICE	Opposition with positive reflections
Parkinson's UK	Opposition with positive reflections
Association of Medical Research Charities	Opposition with positive reflections
Myeloma UK	Opposition with positive reflections
Fight for Sight	Opposition with positive reflections
Other	Opposition with positive reflections
Royal College of Surgeons	Opposition with positive reflections
Forbes Solicitors	Opposition with positive reflections
Royal College Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow	Opposition with positive reflections
Royal College Physicians	Opposition with positive reflections
The Academy of Medical Sciences, Medical Research Council, Wellcome Trust	Opposition with positive reflections
Muscular Dystrophy	Opposition with positive reflections
Other	Supportive with reservations
Legal	Supportive with reservations
Legal	Supportive with reservations
Royal College of Psychiatrists	Supportive with reservations
BASO - The Association for Cancer Surgery	Supportive with reservations
Other	Supportive with reservations
Doctor	Supportive with reservations
Doctor	Supportive with reservations

Doctor	Supportive with reservations
GlaxoSmithKline	Supportive with reservations
Academy of Healthcare Science	Supportive with reservations
Teenage Cancer Trust	Supportive with reservations
NHS Litigation Authority	Supportive with reservations
Cancer Research UK	Supportive with reservations
Save Our Sick Save Our Economy	Supportive with reservations
Patient/ relative/ carer	Supportive with reservations
Patient/ relative/ carer	Supportive with reservations
Other	Supportive with reservations
Other	Supportive with reservations
Other	Supportive with reservations
Patient/ relative/ carer	Supportive with reservations
Patient/ relative/ carer	Supportive with reservations
Other	Supportive with reservations
Genetic Alliance UK	Absolute opposition
PHG Foundation	Absolute opposition
The Patients Association	Absolute opposition
Prostate Cancer UK	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Medical Defence Union	Absolute opposition
Medical Protection Society	Absolute opposition
Association of Personal Injury Lawyers	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Society of Clinical Injury Lawyers	Absolute opposition
Leigh Day	Absolute opposition
Kingsley Napley	Absolute opposition
Irwin Mitchell LLP	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
British Medical Association	Absolute opposition
General Medical Council	Absolute opposition
Royal College of Pathologists	Absolute opposition
Royal College of Surgeons Edinburgh	Absolute opposition
Royal College of Radiologists	Absolute opposition
Academy of Medical Royal Colleges	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition

Doctor	Absolute opposition
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute opposition
Healthwatch	Absolute opposition
Good Thinking	Absolute opposition
Nightingale Collaboration	Absolute opposition
Action Against Medical Accidents	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
NHS England	Absolute opposition
Leukaemia and Lymphoma Research	Absolute opposition
Motor Neurone Disease Association	Absolute opposition
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute opposition
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Legal	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition
Other	Absolute opposition
Doctor	Absolute opposition
Target Ovarian Cancer	Absolute opposition

Ethical Medicines Industry Group	Absolute support
Legal	Absolute support
Legal	Absolute support
Legal	Absolute support
Takeda	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Marie Curie Cancer Care	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Other	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Patient/ relative/ carer	Absolute support
Wellbeing of Women	Absolute support
Health Research Authority	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Doctor	Unclear
Legal	Unclear
Sensium	Unclear
Bayer	Unclear
Breast Cancer UK	Unclear

Kidney Research UK	Unclear
Patient/ relative/ carer	Unclear
Patient/ relative/ carer	Unclear
Patient/ relative/ carer	Unclear
Legal	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Patient/ relative/ carer	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Other	Unclear
Other	Unclear